

# iSchools Doctoral Dissertation Judging Criteria

Drafted August 2015; Updated August 2017

The evaluation criteria for the iSchools Doctoral Dissertation award are as follows:

Criteria for all dissertations:

1. Is the research question well designed? (10 points)
2. Is the research method appropriate to answer the research question? (10 points)
3. Does the literature review put the research question into context? (10 points)
4. Does the literature review put the research method into context? (10 points)

Additional criteria for empirical dissertations:

5. Are the data able to answer the research question? (12 points)
6. Are the data appropriate to the research method? (12 points)
7. Are special problems with data collection convincingly explained? (12 points)
8. Are the data analyzed correctly? (12 points)
9. Are the conclusions valid? (12 points)

Additional criteria for technology / computing dissertations:

5. Is the system design appropriate to the task? (12 points)
6. Is the structure of the solution efficient and reliable? (12 points)
7. Was the system tested fully under appropriate conditions? (12 points)
8. Is there a danger of brittleness (complete failure) or fragility? (12 points)
9. To what degree is the system generalizable? (12 points)

Additional criteria for theoretical/hermeneutical dissertations:

5. Is the argument original? (12 points)
6. Is the argument rigorous and consistent? (12 points)
7. Are counter arguments presented and adequately addressed? (12 points)
8. Are links made from the arguments to pressing problems in the information field? (12 points)
9. Does the dissertation reshape the way we think about information problems? (12 points)

Valuation scale:

10 points out of 10 / 12 out of 12 means a perfect job.

8 points out of 10 / 10 out of 12 means only trivial problems

6 points out of 10 / 7 out of 12 means that the criterion was partly met

4 points out of 10 / 4 out of 12 means that the criterion had flaws

2 points out of 10 / 2 out of 12 means that the criterion was minimally acceptable

0 points out of 10 / 0 out of 12 means that the criterion was missing or seriously flawed.